

Makos Review Lesson 33 - Daf 7B:

1. **Question (Mishnah):** The general rule is, for anything done Derech Yeridah (in a downward motion), he is exiled. For anything not Derech Yeridah, he is not exiled.
Question: What does the Seifa (anything not Derech Yeridah) come to include?
2. **Conclusion of Question:** It includes R. Avahu's case! (Where R' Yochanan ruled that he is exiled)
3. **Counter-question:** What does the Reisha (anything done Derech Yeridah) come to include?
4. **Answer:** You must say that it includes someone chopping meat (Yeridah for the sake of Aliyah, as we will explain);
5. **Answer (and Answer to original Question on R' Yochanan):** Likewise, the Seifa includes someone chopping (Aliyah for the sake of Yeridah, and he is not exiled).
6. **General Scenario:** If a butcher was chopping meat, and he killed;
7. **(Beraisa #1):** If this was while he was swinging in front (of himself), he is liable (Galus). If it was in back, he is exempt;
8. **(Beraisa #2):** If it was in front, he is exempt. If it was in back, he is liable;
9. **(Beraisa #3):** Whether it was in front or in back, he is liable;
10. **(Beraisa #4):** Whether it was in front or in back, he is exempt.
11. **(Rashi) Resolution:** Wherever it says that he is liable, the case is, he was swinging down. Wherever it says that he is exempt, he was swinging up. (E.g. Beraisa #1 obligates in front when he was swinging down, even though this was for the sake of Aliya, to raise it upward with more force. It exempts in back when he was swinging up, even though this was for the sake of Yeridah, to chop down strongly in front.)
12. **Conclusion:** R' Yochanan's ruling is consistent both with the Beraisa and our Mishne - one is exiled for killing with a downward motion even if it was for the purpose of going up, as in the case with the rung that slipped downward, while the person was climbing up.